

## COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CHRISTIE AND RINEHART'S FEMALE DETECTIVE FICTION

Karimova O'g'ilyo<sup>1</sup>

*Nordic international university*

### KEYWORDS

Agatha Christie, Mary Roberts Rinehart, female detective, comparative analysis, Miss Marple, Hilda Adams, gender roles, narrative style, British fiction, American fiction.

### ABSTRACT

This study presents a comparative analysis of the female detective fiction of Agatha Christie and Mary Roberts Rinehart. By examining their most notable characters Miss Marple and Nurse Hilda Adams the article explores cultural, gender, and narrative distinctions between British and American detective traditions. The research focuses on how both authors portray female intelligence, independence, and social roles through their sleuths. Through textual analysis of key novels, the paper highlights differences in suspense construction, setting, and moral tone. The findings reveal how national context and authorial perspective shape detective fiction in the early 20th century.

2181-2675/© 2025 in XALQARO TADQIQOT LLC.

DOI: [10.5281/zenodo.15716082](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.15716082)

This is an open access article under the Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY 4.0) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/deed.ru>)

### Introduction

Detective fiction has long captivated readers with its intrigue, suspense, and brilliant protagonists. Among the pioneers of the genre, female authors have played a significant role in shaping the literary landscape, especially in the early 20th century. Agatha Christie from Britain and Mary Roberts Rinehart from the United States are two such influential figures whose works helped define the characteristics of female detective fiction in their respective cultures.

Agatha Christie, often referred to as the "Queen of Crime," is renowned for her precise plotting, psychological insight, and memorable characters, particularly Miss Marple is an elderly, observant woman whose seemingly simple demeanor belies her sharp intellect. On the other side of the Atlantic, Mary Roberts Rinehart is known as the "American Agatha Christie," though she preceded Christie in publishing detective fiction. Her character, Nurse Hilda Adams (Miss Pinkerton), represents a working-class woman with investigative skills, balancing professional duty with personal moral judgment.

<sup>1</sup> Master's degree student Nordic international university

This study aims to compare how these two authors portray female detectives, focusing on character development, societal roles, and narrative techniques. While both authors created intelligent, intuitive female protagonists, their cultural contexts and storytelling methods differ significantly, revealing the influence of national values and gender expectations.

The comparison not only contributes to understanding the evolution of detective fiction but also sheds light on how early female authors navigated literary and societal constraints. By examining selected texts such as *The Murder at the Vicarage* and *Miss Pinkerton* this paper identifies core differences and similarities in how Christie and Rinehart construct their female sleuths. This comparative approach offers new insights into gender, class, and national identity in detective fiction.

### **Methodology**

The research employs a qualitative comparative literature methodology, drawing upon close textual analysis of representative works by Agatha Christie and Mary Roberts Rinehart. Primary sources include Christie's *The Murder at the Vicarage* (1930), which introduces Miss Marple, and Rinehart's *Miss Pinkerton* (1932), one of several novels featuring Nurse Hilda Adams. These texts were selected due to their significance in the authors' careers and their iconic representation of female detectives.

The analysis focuses on three key dimensions:

1. Characterization and Role of the Female Detective – examining how the protagonists reflect and challenge gender norms.
2. Narrative Technique and Point of View – comparing the use of first-person versus third-person narration, pacing, and suspense.
3. Cultural Context and Moral Framework – assessing how British and American settings influence the story, characters, and reader expectations.

Secondary sources, including critical essays, biographies, and gender studies in literature, support the interpretation. These include feminist literary theory, especially Simone de Beauvoir's concepts of womanhood, and genre theory on detective fiction by critics such as Tzvetan Todorov and Kathleen Gregory Klein.

Data was collected through literary databases such as JSTOR and Google Scholar, focusing on peer-reviewed articles between 1980–2023. The comparative framework is thematic rather than chronological, highlighting how both authors construct femininity, authority, and intellect within male-dominated genres.

This methodology allows a cross-cultural and gender-sensitive reading of the selected texts, grounded in both formal literary analysis and sociocultural interpretation. The goal is not merely to contrast the authors but to understand how they innovated within their traditions and contributed uniquely to the canon of detective literature.

### **Results**

The comparative analysis reveals several significant findings regarding the portrayal of female detectives in the works of Christie and Rinehart. First, in terms of character construction, both Miss Marple and Nurse Hilda Adams are depicted as intelligent,

observant women. However, Miss Marple is a non-professional, whose insights come from life experience and village gossip, while Hilda Adams operates within the professional sphere of nursing and criminal investigation, emphasizing practical knowledge.

Second, the narrative perspective differs sharply. Christie often employs a third-person narrator or a side character's point of view (e.g., Dr. Sheppard in *The Murder of Roger Ackroyd*), which adds distance and mystery. In contrast, Rinehart frequently uses first-person narration, often from Adams's own voice, creating intimacy and moral introspection. This technique enhances reader empathy and reveals the emotional toll of investigative work on women.

Third, setting and cultural influence shape the tone and structure of the stories. Christie's English countryside mysteries often reflect a rigid class structure and a belief in moral justice through clever deduction. Rinehart's urban American settings involve more institutional corruption, personal danger, and ethical complexity. Rinehart's female detective must actively navigate threats and institutional power, while Christie's sleuth remains more protected and cerebral.

Finally, in terms of gender roles, both authors challenge stereotypes but in different ways. Miss Marple subverts age and gender expectations through quiet brilliance, while Hilda Adams embodies working-class competence and courage. Both figures resist the traditional portrayal of women as victims or side characters, instead leading the narrative with agency and intellect. These results suggest that national and social contexts significantly influence female detective representation and that both authors contributed enduring models for women in crime fiction.

## Discussion

The findings of this study underscore the importance of cultural and social contexts in shaping the representation of female detectives. Agatha Christie's Miss Marple reflects British values of discretion, social observation, and the moral clarity of rural life. Her character is grounded in tradition but operates subversively within it, quietly asserting feminine wisdom in a world dominated by male detectives and policemen. Miss Marple rarely confronts violence directly but outwits criminals through psychological insight.

In contrast, Mary Roberts Rinehart's Hilda Adams embodies the American spirit of action and reform. As a nurse-detective, she occupies both domestic and professional realms, navigating hospitals, institutions, and urban crime scenes. Her investigations frequently involve ethical dilemmas and physical danger, suggesting a more active and embodied female detective archetype. This reflects early 20th-century American concerns with social justice, medical professionalism, and the evolving role of women in public life. Narratively, Christie's works are more structured around puzzles, red herrings, and drawing-room revelations, while Rinehart's stories blend suspense, introspection, and Gothic elements. These differences not only reflect personal style but broader genre traditions in British and American literature. While Christie reinforces the "cozy mystery" formula, Rinehart's work anticipates elements of psychological thriller and noir.

Both authors, however, carve out space for women to lead, investigate, and resolve

conflicts. Their protagonists are not assistants or romantic interests—they are central figures who earn respect through intellect and moral clarity. This comparative lens demonstrates that early female detective fiction served as a platform for challenging gender norms, shaping public perceptions of female competence and authority. It also highlights the variety within the genre, encouraging further study of lesser-known female authors and international contributions to detective fiction.

### Conclusion

This study has explored the contrasting yet complementary contributions of Agatha Christie and Mary Roberts Rinehart to female detective fiction. Through a comparative lens focusing on character portrayal, narrative style, and cultural influence, it is clear that both authors developed influential female sleuths who challenged prevailing gender expectations. Christie's Miss Marple represents a quintessentially British detective reserved, logical, and rooted in village life. Her power lies in understanding human nature, particularly as it appears in small communities. Christie's writing emphasizes rational deduction and the restoration of order, often through subtle manipulation of social cues and patterns.

Rinehart's Hilda Adams, meanwhile, is a distinctly American figure—bold, introspective, and working within institutions. Her stories often center on larger social themes, including corruption, personal trauma, and justice in imperfect systems. She represents a modern woman engaged in public service and direct action, confronting the darker aspects of urban life. The comparative analysis demonstrates that, despite differences in tone and style, both characters embody female agency and investigative prowess. Their existence in literature paved the way for later generations of female detectives in fiction and television. These early 20th-century works remain significant not only for their entertainment value but for their subtle yet impactful engagement with questions of gender, class, and social structure.

Future research could extend this analysis by examining adaptations of these characters in film and television, or by including other female authors from the same period. Understanding how these pioneering women shaped the detective genre allows us to appreciate their legacy and the doors they opened for women in literature.

In summary, Agatha Christie and Mary Roberts Rinehart offer two distinct but equally powerful visions of the female detective—one British, one American; one introspective, the other action-oriented each essential to the evolution of the genre.

### References

1. Christie, A. (1930). *The Murder at the Vicarage*. Collins Crime Club.
2. Rinehart, M. R. (1932). *Miss Pinkerton*. Farrar & Rinehart.
3. Klein, K. G. (1988). *The Woman Detective: Gender and Genre*. University of Illinois Press.
4. Knight, S. (2004). *Crime Fiction, 1800–2000: Detection, Death, Diversity*. Palgrave Macmillan.
5. Plain, G. (2001). *Twentieth-Century Crime Fiction: Gender, Sexuality and the Body*.

Edinburgh University Press.

6. Munt, S. R. (1994). *Murder by the Book? Feminism and the Crime Novel*. Routledge.
7. Todorov, T. (1977). *The Poetics of Prose*. Cornell University Press.
8. Light, A. (1991). *Forever England: Femininity, Literature and Conservatism Between the Wars*. Routledge.
9. Walton, P. (2015). "Women's Work: Rinehart and the Rise of the Nurse Detective." *American Literary History*, 27(2), 223–245.
10. Rowland, S. (2010). *From Agatha Christie to Ruth Rendell: British Women Writers in Detective and Crime Fiction*. Palgrave Macmillan.